

# **Independent Evaluation of the International Trade Centre (ITC)**

---

**Final Report**

Annex VIII

**SAANA CONSULTING**

## ANNEX VIII: Examples from past evidence on ITC's contributions to results

**Note:** The Independent Evaluation Team carefully examined the sources cited here, as well as many others, in building its own assessments of the types of contributions that have been claimed and can be claimed. These excerpts, which cannot do full justice to the full studies, do give a sense of the range of types of contributions claimed over recent years for different types of ITC products and services and also some sense of the variable plausibility of such claims. The annual evaluation syntheses produced by ITC's Evaluation Unit are another important and accessible source for evaluation evidence on this and other issues.

Country Region	Evidence on contributions to results claimed	Source
<b>NTF II</b>		
<b>Bangladesh</b>	<p>As a result of TSI strengthening, involved SMEs learned how to market themselves as providers of specific services, by participating in training in B2B meetings.</p> <p>Increase in exports to Europe (on average by 20%) was reported by 24 out of the 40 companies involved in the project. "Some representatives of mostly smaller companies reported that they doubled, tripled and even quadrupled their company size through the contracts obtained thanks to the project"</p>	Evaluation 2013
<b>Senegal</b>	11% increase of export value of Senegal mangos	
<b>EPRP and Sector Wide Silk Projects (Phase I and II)</b>		
<b>Cambodia</b>	In general terms, EPRP can be considered as having achieved positive outcomes, with important contributions made in upgrading the technical skills base in rural communities, and bringing to them a greater awareness of market opportunities.	Review 2006
	<p>The Sector Wide Silk Project I and II trained a total of 575 weavers in 39 communities at the time of the mid-term evaluation, that is, 50% more weavers than foreseen by the plan.</p> <p>It is unlikely that the 40% increase of household income has been achieved, due mainly to the concurrence of unfavourable market conditions (in primis, raw material prices skyrocketed during the course of the projects). However, ITC-supported in-depth weaver training, and networking and information-exchange among involved communities have favoured some significant accomplishments and have increased the capacity of trained weavers to cope with the currently bad market situation.</p> <p>These concern especially: the supply of raw materials - a severe issues prior to the intervention - that has been secured through the establishment of purchasing units in at least 10 weavers' groups at the time of the MTE; the introduction of new tools and equipment, now utilised on a daily basis by the 39 communities, has resulted in higher efficiency, in some cases allowing to double speed the production process; for the few weavers specifically supported to align the weaving process towards export markets, the new demand-adjusted product designs and an active search for markets steadily increased total export sales. a better understanding of the field of designs, colour combinations and patterns among producers and intermediaries; leading to a better product quality, a very positive market reaction to the new demand-adjusted products. Overall, across the communities, ITC-supported information and networking have allowed for a better understanding of design, patterns and colour combination.</p>	Mid-Term Evaluation 2011
<b>Trade Promotion (Phase I, II and III)</b>		

Kyrgyzstan / Tajikistan	<p><b>Phase I and II (fruit and vegetable sector)</b></p> <p>All stakeholders acknowledged a considerable development leap achieved through the project. In particular, concerning quality infrastructure improvement, practical assistance received by participating enterprises, a substantial increase in the capabilities of business support providers and significant steps initiated towards the ratification of the export strategy.</p> <p>On the meso-level of BSPs, theoretical and on-the-job training provided the basis for service development in terms of increased client base, following improved references, and opportunities going beyond the know-how acquired through project implementation. On the micro-level, several enterprises reported a strengthening of their market position following inputs in product development.</p> <p>At the impact level, it is difficult to attribute with certainty to ITC intervention the better performance of the fruit and vegetable (F&amp;V) processing enterprises participating to the project in Kyrgyzstan between 2006 and 2007 (12% difference in export value growth, as compared to the rest of the F&amp;V processing sector). However, on the micro-level pilot enterprises managed to survive on the market, thus securing the jobs of several hundreds of employees, representing a significant outcome in a sector in a process of consolidation. Thus, while on one side the poverty reduction impact of project activities was not significant at the time of the project evaluation (2008), according to many business owners and managers, enterprises benefited from improving internal procedures (technology, products, operations), and from a shift in their mindset towards market-orientated decision making, following the intensive programme of trade fair participation, seminars and trainings.</p>	Final External Evaluation 2008
	<p><b>Phase III (textile and clothing)</b></p> <p>- although it is too early to assess the project impact, it was reported that a significant effect of Phase III is to have overall initiated the process of changing mentality towards a more market-oriented one.</p>	ITC staff interviewed
<b>AAACP Programme – Cotton Sector</b>		
Zambia	ITC-accompanied study tours and market visits had helped farmers in Zambia to change power structures in the industry, allowing for the establishment of the first ever Zambian-owned as well as farmer-owned ginnery.	AAACP Completion Report, EU
Tanzania	The Tanzania Cotton Board (TCB) was able to develop and roll out an approach for contract-farming; cotton quality parameters improved following ITC-facilitated training by a Thai spinning factory in Tanzania; training of gin inspectors in Thailand led to the incorporation of contamination reduction technology, productivity enhancement and production technology in TCB' s regular training activities and reached out to approximately 300,000 farmers.	Internal ITC document
Tanzania	Three Tanzanian ginners and one Thai spinner agreed upon first direct sales for the delivery of 400 tons of cotton worth in total US\$1.26 million	AAACP Completion Report, EU
Malawi / Zambia	A Malawian ginner that benefitted from AAACP assistance (market linkages) established a new ginnery in Zambia. A 5000-farmer cooperative was able to sell around 3000 tons of seed cotton to this new ginnery, at a 20% higher price than they would have received by selling their cotton to multinational cotton ginners they were traditionally selling to.	Internal ITC document
Malawi	A ginning factory signed a sales contract for direct delivery to a Bangladeshi spinning factor for 500 tons of cotton worth over US\$2,20 million.	AAACP Completion Report, EU

ESA region	The possibility to develop substantial market linkages (Tanzania and Malawi) through the programme was a great value, especially considered the industry's atomised structure in the region.	AAACP Completion Report, EU
<b>AAACP Programme – Non-cotton sector</b>		
Cameroon - Coffee	<p>Positive achievements and impact concern especially coffee quality, value chain efficiency, access to finance and market linkages. More specifically:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- quality improvement: innovative washing stations/coffee processing units introduced in four coffee growing regions in Cameroon (with cofunding from the World Bank) and 1200 station community coffee producers directly trained in improving coffee plantation production and pollution control;</li> <li>- value chain efficiency: about 96 community extension volunteers trained in good agricultural practices, including on-farm training;</li> <li>- 40 tonnes of fully washed coffee already sold as AAA speciality quality in regional and European markets for +25% premium over previous best coffee from Cameroon;</li> <li>- access to finance and community investment: development banks finance coffee production at community washing stations; moreover, in 2011, following initial results, communities have leveraged savings and borrowed to establish another 7 coffee washing station;</li> <li>- market linkages: 40 tonnes of fully washed coffee sold as AAA speciality quality in regional and European markets for +25% premium over previous best coffee from Cameroon; at least two major international specialty coffee importers ready to buy 2011 / 2012 season harvest, and Cameroon coffee on sale in Germany, France, Switzerland, UK.</li> </ul>	Report on Actual Outcomes, 2011
Cameroon - Cassava	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Two pilot processing &amp; storage units installed, capable of producing different cassava-related products; one of the two pilot projects is under the management of the "Interest Group of Active Women of Ngomou", which reflects that over 60% of stakeholders in the cassava value chains are women;</li> <li>- community income increased following the introduction of new processing techniques, with over 100 women benefitting.</li> </ul>	AAACP Completion Report, EU
Ethiopia - Spices	Following the recommendations of market and product development specialists under the AAACP, several spice growers and processors successfully transformed their traditional operations into higher value added products, selling them for over two seasons to buyers in India.	AAACP Completion Report, EU
Samoa - Fruit & Vegetables	New sales of products and increased exports, including from women-led community enterprises, following ITC-led market match-making; ISO certification obtained by 6 enterprises, 4 others expected in 2012 (total 80% of all Samoan food sector).	Report on Actual Outcomes, 2011
Solomon Islands - Coconut & coconut products:	Following ITC-facilitated technical missions to the Philippines, new processing techniques, appropriate equipment sources and growing techniques incorporated locally; overall improved supply chains and increased volume of good quality coconuts attracting new investors, also suggested by the replanting of decimated coconut groves that is in progress for the first time in over 10 years.	Report on Actual Outcomes, 2011

Grenada – Spices	<p>- Nutmeg replanting levels increased (over 500 acres replanted nutmeg) , 250% increase in farmers delivering nutmegs (1500 farmers returning to the sector); up to 600 mt exported at end of the programme against 200 mt at start of ITC intervention, likely \$EC 600,000 influx into the economy against \$EC 100,000 before ITC intervention;</p> <p>- replanting of decimated coconut groves in progress for the first time in more than 10 years, suggesting that the sector is now able to attract new investors and entrepreneurs.</p>	Report on Actual Outcomes, 2011
<b>PCTP – Ethical Fashion Initiative</b>		
Kenya	<p>The programme under the EFI has successfully provided for the productive and commercial integration of inhabitants (particularly women) of disadvantaged communities into the value chain of the international fashion market. The 1,143 beneficiaries reportedly had an income impact, i.e. 7.5% increase as compared to the control group, with a stronger impact for beneficiary women (23.5% more than men); capacity building in terms of finance management has empowered beneficiaries to use and manage the income received during orders in a sustainable way; in addition, the entire women sample surveyed under the programme Evaluation reported increased respect from their male counterparts, following their ability to earn a living, 94% of the total correspondents reported learning of new skills and 78% mentioned being able to utilize the skills learnt for their own jobs. Incidentally, since the biggest order coincided with the time of an extremely severe famine and drought, most communities experienced increased resilience thanks to the programme.</p>	Mid-Term Evaluation 2013
<b>Supply Chain Management</b>		
Global	<p>- ITC-offered "train the trainers" support to 225 trainers in 2011 had an outreach of approximately 3,500 participants; all local organizations interviewed under the 2011 Evaluation reported training and material development support provided to their network as a strong advantage of adopting the MLS-SCM program. The multiplication effect achievable by the MLS-SCM's delivery model is considered as a strength in terms of local organization development, nevertheless, a high number of low performing or inactive institutions emerged (43% of inactive and 14% performing at very low level);</p> <p>- Thanks to the strong multiplier effect and financial contribution to partner institutions under the programme, supply-related financial savings of over US\$50 million have been reported by beneficiaries enterprises, while it is estimated that the programme generated about US\$2,6 million in revenues for local organizations and most of these either made a profit or achieved break-even in the delivery of the programme.</p>	Final Report 2012
<b>Women and Coffee</b>		
ESA Region	<p>Women from 12 countries received training that helped several to engage with buyers under the Global Platform for Action on Sourcing from Women Vendors, which has since resulted in commercial transactions. Evidence available reports high success of IWCA Burundi Chapter, US\$400,000 worth of sales, and women involved paid for the very first time from the sales of their coffee. Overall, women benefited from improved production techniques and greater contractual power (approach buyers jointly), however, quantification of these outcomes, expected for 2013, not available.</p> <p>Reported positive social impact on women's awareness of their role in the coffee sector.</p>	IWCA / ITC website
<b>PACT II</b>		
COMESA, ECOWAS & ECCAS Regions	<p>PACT II has been successful in building trade analytical expertise and information systems, in helping to define and promote sector strategies, and in building the capacity of the Regional Economic Commissions (REC's) to support trade development and Trade Support Institutions (TSI's). However, it is clear from the MTR that this goal is too ambitious, especially because of too limited amount of time and the fact that PACT II does not engage directly at the enterprise level (except for the Access! component) , where these expected changes should materialise.</p>	Mid-Term Evaluation 2011

	For this reason, the MTR suggests to concentrate on one of the four outcome areas, that is “to strengthen the capacity of regional and national institutions to build support capacity for trade, by consolidating that capacity in the RECs and making them able to transfer it to TSIs”.	
<b>EIF</b>		
<b>Sierra Leone</b>	Expected results for the EIF Sierra Leone concerned the ability of the MTI to offer its user groups effective and relevant trade information services through the Sierra Leone Investment and Export Promotion Agency (SLIEPA) and an enhanced information management capacity of the MTI. The following results have been achieved: a detailed development plan for a trade information unit in SLIEPA was elaborated; a training programme on trade information management, aiming at strengthening the trade information capacity of SLIEPA staff, was designed and implemented; appropriate platform and technical support were provided for the operationalization of SLIEPA’s Trade Information Centre.	Final Report 2010
<b>Expansion of intra- and inter-regional trade among Member states of CEMAC, UEMOA and francophone countries in the Mekong region</b>		
<b>UEMOA and CEMAC regions, Francophone countries in the Mekong region</b>	<p>The project supported the organisation of commercial missions and seller/buyer meetings, particularly in the wood value chain in Vietnam (2011) and in the Republic of Congo (2012). Effects of these activities are the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Development of an economic intelligence on Vietnam and CEMAC and UEMOA countries, favouring: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- the public sector, in the formulation of bilateral cooperation policy and in the provision of strategic economic and trade information on operators in the wood and wood-derived products value chains;</li> <li>- TSIs, through the diversification of their services providing support on access to international markets and through capacity building on preparation, organisation and follow-up on seller/buyer meetings. However, the ITC should provide technical assistance to improve the organisation of such meetings and ensure a structured follow-up leading to sound evidence of results;</li> <li>- the private sector, through access to structured and reliable trade information; to be used by Vietnamese buyers to define a new strategy to buy wood internationally, identify new suppliers and new tropical essences for product diversification, build direct trade relations with sellers to rationalise the wood value chain; private sector from CEMAC and UEMOA access new international clientele and export opportunities;</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>However, lack of sufficiently coordinated follow up by ITC and regular reporting by TSIs has made it difficult to obtain quantitative data on the creation of new trade relations.</p> <p>The project has also supported the organisation of seminars on food security and ISO standard compliance in Benin, Togo and Senegal, forming 54 participants, consultants and quality experts in the food and agri-food sector and auditing 11 enterprises.</p> <p>The impact of the project is still difficult to measure, especially since the present evaluation is mid-term, but it can be said that a structured system to generate trade information has been set up and there is a strong potential for increase in trade flows, considered 80% of wood needs in Vietnam are imported and the bilateral relations established between Chambers of Commerce in beneficiary countries. However, improved follow-up system and organisation of buyer/seller meetings are required in order to appreciate the extent of new transactions created thanks to the project.</p>	Mid-Term Evaluation 2012

Trade, Climate Change and Environment Programme		
Peru – Biotrade	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Biotrade project demonstrates a good rate of return on the support provided to six Peruvian biotrade exporters aimed at optimizing their participation in a leading US trade fair;</li> <li>- The Latin Pharma sub-project (TA to 92 Latin American pharma exporters) within the Biotrade project is effective and efficient but is not mainly targeted at sustainably produced products, supporting exports of pharmaceutical products in general. Thus it lacks coherence with the wider project and with TCCEP generally;</li> <li>- More than positive evidence of a provision of good quality TA as well as of a good pool of actual and potential Peruvian beneficiaries and an effective Peruvian TSI partner</li> </ul>	Mid-term Evaluation 2012
Zambia – Organic	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Some results have been attained in each of the Project's areas of activity but it is still too early to determine whether significant supply and exporting marketing capacity has been built amongst Zambia's organic producers (Project's main objective);</li> <li>- however, the project lacks a sufficient base of enterprise beneficiaries to have a significant long-term impact, and local TSI partner proved rather ineffective.</li> </ul>	
Kenya – Climate Change	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Implementation unavoidably delayed due to fatal illness of the lead consultant; delay in producing the Guide to carbon foot printing for use by horticultural exporters resulted in low Project effectiveness and efficiency;</li> <li>- A dissemination workshop (one of the project's objectives) has been held, but planned post-workshop activities have not been implemented, mainly due to the delay of the Guide following withdrawal by the partner TSI FPEAK;</li> <li>- interviews with stakeholders indicated evidence of continuing demand for the Project in the horticultural sector, and of a good pool of potential beneficiary enterprises; following the workshop, a new sub-Project has been added, on climate mitigation on the tea sector.</li> </ul>	
General	<p>Conclusion: relative to the size of Programme budget, the number of distinct Projects or components is excessive and rationalization of the Programme should be considered with a view to concentrating resources where there appears to be the greatest potential for results and/or where the interventions are most innovatory, and hence have the potential to generate new learning experiences for the development assistance community generally. This should also reduce coordination costs and increase economies of scale.</p>	